Let's show some love! #ThisPlaceMatters
Community-wide Virtual Public Meeting
Thursday August 6, 2020 (6 – 7 pm)

An on-line community conversation about the process and desired design character for the V&E Local Historic Landmarks District.
A copy of V&E Design Guidelines Draft #2 & this Presentation is available on www.VECA.org
(This link will also be shared as a follow-up message through your Eventbrite registration)

Time has been reserved at the end of the session for (Q&A) Question & Answers.

If you have questions, please use the Chat feature sent to everyone.
(Your question will be seen by everyone, so I suggest keeping that panel up so you can see what questions are being asked along with the answers to prevent asking duplicate questions.)

This meeting will last just one hour. If we receive more questions than we can answer within the hour, you can send your questions or comments to (vecahistoric@gmail.com) or mail them to (VECA, Attention: Landmarks, 1680 Jackson Avenue, Memphis, TN 38107).
Community-wide Virtual Public Meeting

Agenda

1. “Welcome” & Housekeeping
2. Initiative Background
3. Landmarks Process / V&E Character
4. Design Guidelines Comments & Edits to Date
5. Questions, Comments & Conversation
6. Wrap Up & Next Steps
Vollintine Evergreen is its residents, its buildings and its natural and public spaces.

Think for a moment, what do you value about where you live?

What is irreplaceable to you about the neighborhood?

What are your thoughts on these key areas for design review and guidelines?

What would you and future generations miss if it were no longer here?
# VECA & Neighborhood Planning

## A Brief History: Logical Progression to the Current Strategy

### Civic Engagement
VECA as a formal neighborhood organization was primarily founded because of redlining in the early 1970’s and blockbusting efforts by private realtors.

### Zoning
A rezoning study using volunteers was started in 1974 but was not completed. At the time, the funds were not available to pay for a consultant.

### Code Enforcement
The neighborhood has used code enforcement to improve housing conditions. This strategy has meant working intensely with city and county officials.

### Rezoning
In 1996 as part of the Neighborhood Preservation Initiative Grant, VECA underwent a comprehensive review of zoning. A new zoning plan was approved and adopted by City Council in 1997.

### National Register
From 1997 to 2007, volunteers working through VECA successfully got most of the neighborhood designated on the National Register of Historic Places.
Historic Consulting Team

ANDY KITSINGER
AIA-AICP, Architect & Community Planner

Andy is an architect and community planner with the Development Studio. He serves as director of the University of Memphis Design Collaborative. He has chaired and spent six years as a member of the Memphis Landmarks Commission.

JUDITH JOHNSON
Architectural Historian & Preservation Planner

Judith has 26 years of experience working in historic preservation, primarily protecting and preserving the built environment in the Memphis area. She served as a Tennessee advisor to the National Trust for Historic Preservation.

MARGOT PAYNE
Architectural Historian, Writer, & Restoration Specialist

Margot is an architectural historian, restoration specialist, and writer. She was appointed to the State Review Board of the Tennessee Historical Commission in 2018 and serves as an Architectural Historian reviewing nominations from Tennessee to the National Register of Historic Places.
Landmarks is a local tool available for preserving and stabilizing historic areas is local Landmarks designation. Memphis currently has 16 designated Districts.

Each district has its own set of design guidelines to govern demolition, new construction and rehabilitation. Residents of each district determine what types of activities are addressed in their guidelines.
Tennessee Code Annotated
TCA 13-7-4: Local Landmarks Purpose & Authority

Purpose
‘to promote the educational, cultural, and economic welfare of Tennessean’s by enabling municipalities and counties to preserve & protect historic structures, areas, and districts.’

Authority
‘the municipality is empowered to establish special historic districts or zones, and to regulate the construction, repair, alteration, rehabilitation, relocation and demolition of any building or other structure, within the boundaries of any historic district.’
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>National Register Districts</th>
<th>Local Landmarks Districts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Nominations Reviewed by TN State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO)</td>
<td>• Based on state enabling legislation (TCA 13-7-4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Federal Government Designates property as worthy of preservation</td>
<td>• Local government establishes zoning overlay districts and appoints commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Does not prevent demolition or create any limits to property owners</td>
<td>• Landmarks Commission regulates changes to property within district</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
WHAT A LOCAL HISTORIC LANDMARK ZONING DOES DO?

1. It does protect the historic character of the designated area;

2. It does require review of all additions, demolitions and new construction, including new fences, walls, retaining walls, satellites dishes, and signs;

3. It does require review of exterior alterations beyond normal maintenance and repair to properties within the designated area;

4. It does provide property owners with information on how to take care of older properties;

5. It does stabilize and improve property values; and

6. It does foster civic pride.
WHAT A LOCAL HISTORIC LANDMARK ZONING DOES NOT DO?

1. It does not require review of alterations & new construction to the interior of a building;

2. It does not control work not visible from a public street or rights of way;

3. It does not apply standards to work done before an area becomes a Landmark District;

4. It does not force owners to improve their property;

5. It does not consider, review, or control use of property;

6. It does not prohibit buildings from being constructed;

7. It does not prohibit additions or changes from being made to a property; or

8. It does not require review of ordinary maintenance, repair or in-kind replacement work.
V&E Historic Landmarks Designation & Design Guidelines

This Initiative builds a base for an informed community conversation about appropriate design character & regulations within Vollintine-Evergreen historic district.

Landmarks Designation Process:

Step 1: Data Collection & Public Engagement

Step 2: Draft Overlay Zoning & Design Guidelines

Step 3: Zoning & Final Design Guidelines Documents

Step 4: Regulatory Submission & Adoption Process

4a: Memphis Landmark Commission Review & Approval

4b: Land Use Control Board Review & Approval

4c: Memphis City Council Review & Approval
V&E Historic Landmarks Designation & Design Guidelines

Vollintine Evergreen (V&E) Neighborhood

Historic Design Guidelines & Users Guide

Memphis Landmarks Commission
DRAFT #2
August 6, 2020

V&E Design Guidelines
& User Guide
Draft #2 is online @

https://veca.org/landmarks-2/

Public Comments Due:
Thursday August 27, 2020
6 pm CT
Community-wide Public Meeting #2: August 6th
Public release of DG Draft #2: August 6th
DG Draft #2 all review comments due: August 27th
Submission of DG (Final) Draft to Historic Committee: Sept. 24th
Historic Committee approval of DG Final Draft & App.: October 1st
VECA Board approval of DG Final Draft & App.: October 5th
Submission of DG Final Draft & App to MLC: October 22nd
Memphis Landmarks Commission (MLC) review & approval: Nov. 19
VOLLINTINE EVERGREEN HISTORIC NEIGHBORHOOD
Historic Zoning Overlay & Design Guidelines
VOLLINTINE EVERGREEN HISTORIC NEIGHBORHOOD
Proposed Historic Zoning Boundary Map

(NHD) INDICATES NATIONAL HISTORIC DISTRICT
ONLINE POLL: VOTE

WHICH NEIGHBORHOOD CHARACTER AREA IN V&E DO YOU LIVE?

Add your # in the chat box.
I. Introduction
Vision for Vollintine Evergreen
Boundary Map
Purpose of the Design Guidelines
Work to be Reviewed
Using the Design Guidelines

II. Neighborhood Traditions and Historic Context
Neighborhood Design Traditions
Architectural Resources & Non-contributing Buildings
Vollintine Evergreen Architectural Styles
Neighborhood Design Principles

III. Design Guideline Categories
Neighborhood Design (ND)
Site Design (SD)
Building Design (BD)
   Newly Constructed & Infill Buildings
   Alterations to Historic Contributing Structures
   Additions to Historic Contributing Structures
   Commercial & Institutional Structures
   Demolition of Existing Structures

IV. Key Miscellaneous Topics
Sustainability & Resiliency
Exterior Signage
Exterior Lighting
Landscape Structures
Maintenance & Repair
Painting Guide
Public Art

V. Glossary of Terms

Sources

Appendix
Preservation Briefs Series, Technical Publications
Incentives for Historic Structures
United States Secretary of the Interior: Standards for the Rehabilitation of Historic Buildings
Neighborhood Character Areas

Vollintine Evergreen NR Historic District

The Vollintine Evergreen National Historic District was listed in 1996 and is comprised of 3218 primary and secondary structures, mostly constructed between 1922 and 1928. Its building stock consists of one, one and one-half, and two-story residential buildings; garages; multi-family apartment buildings; churches; and one-part commercial blocks. The majority of the largely intact and homogenous residential building stock are excellent examples of Eclectic style residences such as Bungalows, Tudor cottages, Colonial and Spanish Revival and Minimal Traditional forms.
Neighborhood Character Areas

Vollintine Evergreen Avalon NR Historic District

The Vollintine Evergreen Avalon Historic District was listed in 1997 and is comprised of 459 primary and secondary structures, mostly constructed between late 1920s and early 1940s. Its building stock consists of one, one and one-half, and two-story residential buildings; (there is only one two-story in Avalon), garages, one school, and one commercial block. The housing stock in the western, older section of the district exhibits homogenous examples of late 1920s and 1930s Tudor and Craftsman styles. This district is different than the Vollintine Evergreen in that the eastern section is comprised of Minimal Traditional, Cape Cod, and Colonial Revival style homes built on curvilinear streets in the early 1940s.
Neighborhood Character Areas

Vollintine Evergreen North NR Historic District

The Vollintine Evergreen North (NR) Historic District was listed in 1997 and is comprised of 282 primary and secondary structures, mostly constructed between **late 1920s and early 1940s**. Its building stock consists of one, one and one-half residential buildings; (there is only one two-story), and along with garages. The housing stock flows between the older section of the district exhibiting homogenous examples of late 1920s and 1930s **Tudor and Craftsman styles** on gridded street patterns and the newer section of the made up of late 1930’s and early 1940’s **Colonial Revival style** homes built on curvilinear streets. From east to west the architectural styles change from **Eclectic style cottages** to **Minimal Traditional Cap Cod homes** in Rainbow Circle.
The Vollintine Hills NR Historic District was listed in 2007 and is comprised of 79 primary structures, mostly constructed between 1946-1957 in conjunction with the development of former Baron Hirsch Synagogue in the International style. The original 1946 plat for the neighborhood included a large reserved parcel for the eventual construction of the synagogue, which completed its first phase in 1950-52. Of the 79 principal buildings in the district, 34 are Minimal Traditional houses, 26 are Traditional Ranch houses, 17 are Massed Ranch houses, one is a Tudor Revival house.
Neighborhood Character Areas

Vollintine Evergreen North-West Neighborhood Area

The Vollintine Evergreen North-West Neighborhood Area is comprised of 76 single-family residences and 15 multi-family units for a total of 91 primary structures, mostly constructed between 1950 and 1970. No count of secondary buildings was performed. The building stock consists of one and a single, two-story single-family and duplex residential buildings. The multi-family complex building stock consists of two story, attached sections buildings with very modest Colonial Revival detailing. The styles are Minimal Traditional, and Traditional Ranch houses. A few infill houses are interspersed in the area. A few houses are deteriorated as of this writing and there are 17 random vacant lots throughout the neighborhood.
Neighborhood Character Areas

Edward Avenue Neighborhood Area

The Edward Avenue Neighborhood Area is comprised of 101 primary and secondary structures, mostly constructed between late 1930s and early 1970s. Its building stock consists of one, one and one-half, and only a couple of two-story residential buildings. The housing stock flows between the older section, being a homogenous example of the late 1930s Craftsman style and the newer sections is made up of Colonial Revival and Minimal Traditional homes and duplexes built in the 1950s and 1960s. Some newest sections include 1970s Traditional homes built within cul-de-sacs.
Neighborhood Character Areas

Cypress Neighborhood Area

The Cypress Neighborhood Area is comprised of ~382 primary and secondary structures, mostly constructed between the 1920s and early 1950s, with a significant portion of apartment buildings and duplexes built in the 1960s. Its building stock consists of one, one and one-half, and two-story residential buildings (modern duplexes), garages, one school, three churches, and one commercial block. There are three major apartment complexes: a Minimal Traditional U-plan in the north of the district, the large ca. 1964 Contemporary style University Gardens Manor in the center of the district, and two rows of ca. 1967 Contemporary style duplexes along Vollintine and University. The housing stock flows between the older section in the north along Springdale, being a nearly homogenous example of the late 1920s and 1930s English Tudor Cottages and Craftsman styles, and the newer sections made up of Minimal Traditional homes built on circular streets in the late 1940s and early 1950s.
Vollintine Evergreen Architectural Styles

Vollintine Evergreen exhibits a wide range of American architectural style because of its extended development period from 1900 to today.

- **Colonial Revival** (circa 1880-1955)
- **English Tudor Cottage** (circa 1890-1940)
- **Craftsman Foursquare** (circa 1900-1930)
- **Craftsman Bungalow** (circa 1905-1930)
- **Minimal Traditional** (circa 1935-1960)
- **Ranch Style** (circa 1935-1975)
- **Vernacular Cottage** (Neo-Colonial) (circa 1930-1955)
- **Cape Cod** (circa 1920-1940)
V&E Design Guideline Sections

Key Focus Areas

Building Design (BD)

1. Exterior Alterations & Additions

2. Requirements for Demolition

3. Commercial & Institutional Centers

4. Newly Constructed Infill Buildings
Design Guidelines
Exterior Alterations

Retain the integrity of your home by identifying and treating character-defining architectural features properly.

- Character-Defining Features of a Historic Home
- Major Repairs vs. Routine Maintenance
- Treatment of Historic Features
  - Maintain ➔ Repair ➔ Replace ➔ Reconstruct
- Building Materials
- Common Alterations
  - Window Openings
  - Porches

Example of inappropriate exterior alterations that remove character-defining features and create a false architectural history.
Character-Defining Features

“Every old building is unique, with its own identity and its own distinctive character. Character refers to all those visual aspects and physical features that comprise the appearance of every historic building.
– National Park Service

- window and door openings
- siding or cladding
- front porches, steps, and terraces
- porch details, such as columns, brackets, or balustrades
- foundations, walls, and porch piers
- masonry colors and the artful layout of brick design patterns and stonework
- relationship of the structure to the landscape, streetscape, and surrounding
Major Repairs vs. Routine Maintenance

- Routine maintenance of a property that does not involve altering historic fabric does not need approval from the Memphis Landmarks Commission (MLC) unless it will change the exterior appearance.

- Design Guidelines include volunteer Maintenance & Repair guide under Miscellaneous Topics. This brief guide is presented not as a directive, but as a helpful resource for property owners who wish to implement a regular preventative maintenance schedule to best take care of their property.

- Regular maintenance addresses problems prior to noticeable deterioration, preventing the need for more aggressive treatments such as repair or reconstruction, which require review by the MLC.
Treatment of Historic Features

Maintain ➔ Repair ➔ Replace ➔ Reconstruct

1. MAINTAIN: If a feature is intact and in good condition, maintain it as such.
   • Continued maintenance is always the best method.
   • Use the gentlest means possible.

2. REPAIR: If a feature is deteriorated or damaged, repair it to its original condition.
   • Repair is always preferred over replacement. Repair only those features that are deteriorated using methods that will not harm the original materials.

3. REPLACE: If it is not feasible to repair the feature, replace it with one that is the same or similar in character (materials, detail, finish) to the original.
   • Replace only that portion that is beyond repair.

4. RECONSTRUCT: If the feature is missing entirely, reconstruct it from appropriate evidence.
   • Alterations that seek to imply an earlier period than that of the building are inappropriate.
Materials

• Historically, **wood, brick, stone** and **stucco** were the dominant building materials in the V & E neighborhood.

• **Do not obscure, damage, destroy or remove significant original architectural details and materials of the primary structure.**

• When replacement of façade material is needed, replace material in-kind. **If substitute or modern materials must be used, they should match the original in appearance as closely as is possible.**
Design Guidelines

Exterior Alterations

Window Openings

- Windows and doors are some of the most important character-defining features of houses. Distinctive window design often defines a historic building style. Most windows are inset into openings or they have surrounding casings and sash components which have substantial dimensions.

- Retain original windows, doors and their hardware when they can be repaired and reused in place.

- Maintain position and proportions of original windows and doors. The original doorway configuration should be preserved in any situation.

- A replacement window or door should match the scale and dimensions of those seen traditionally on the house.

The vinyl replacement windows in the left image lack the depth & profile of traditional windows shown on the right.
Porches

- Retain original porch materials, dimensions, and architectural detailing.
- Open front porches shall not be fully enclosed to create additional indoor space.
  - Enclosing a porch with opaque materials is inappropriate.
  - Enclosing a porch with large areas of glass or screen material may be acceptable, as long as framing does not interfere with porch supports and is set behind them.

Like window and door openings, the front porch or terrace is often one of the most important character-defining features of a building.

Photo 1: Avoid enclosing existing porches with solid wall materials

Photo 2: Example of compatible balcony enclosure
Basic Principles for Additions

Many buildings have experienced additions over time as need for additional space occurred. The tradition of adding on to buildings is expected to continue in the V & E neighborhood.

1. An addition should be designed in such a manner that if it were to be removed in the future, the essential form & integrity of the original structure would not be impaired.

2. An addition should be subordinate in scale and character to the main building.

3. It should be constructed with materials that are similar to those used on the primary structure.
Design of Additions

• The overall design of the addition must be in keeping with that of the primary structure and not obscure any significant features of the building.

• At the same time, it should be distinguishable visually from the original portion, so that the evolution of the building can be understood.

• Place an addition at the rear of a building or set it back from the front to minimize the visual impacts, allowing the original proportions and character to remain prominent.

• Use building materials that are compatible with those of the primary structure
  • The roof pitch, window design and general form should be compatible with the primary structure.
Appropriate Scale for Additions

1. A new addition should be compatible in mass, scale and form with the primary building.
2. The size of the addition should be small in relation to the main structure.
3. For a larger addition, break up the mass of the addition into smaller modules that relate to the historic house.
Design Guidelines
Additions

Appropriate Scale for Additions

1. A new addition should be compatible in mass, scale and form with the primary building.
2. The size of the addition should be small in relation to the main structure.
3. For a larger addition, break up the mass of the addition into smaller modules that relate to the historic house.
Rehabilitating Historic Commercial Storefronts

Preserve the repetition of standard elements for visual unity on the street.

C.1 Become familiar with the style of your building and the role of the storefront in the overall design. Don't "early up" a front.

C.2 Preserve the storefront's character even though there is a new use on the interior If less exposed window area is desirable, consider the use of interior blinds and insulating curtains rather than altering the existing historic fabric.

C.3 Avoid use of materials that were unavailable when the storefront was constructed; this includes vinyl and aluminum siding, anodized aluminum, mirrored or tinted glass, artificial stone, and brick veneer.

C.4 All renovations should preserve these character-defining elements:
   - Display windows: the main portion of glass on the storefront.
   - Transom: the upper portion of the display, separated from the main display window by a frame.
   - Kick plate: found beneath the display window.
   - Entry: Usually set back from the sidewalk in a protected recess.

The general guiding principal of excellent storefront design is to keep it simple, and to let the architectural elements of your building and storefront speak clearly.

Illustration 19: Not all buildings have all the architectural elements above, but these storefront components should translate to most building types.
Design Guidelines
Commercial & Institutional Centers

The symbolism and function of schools, churches and other civic and institutional buildings usually result in distinctive designs. These structures are the visual landmarks scattered throughout the community. They usually have a larger surrounding site and their architectural design reflects their importance in the life of the community.

1. Become familiar with the style of your building and the role of the storefront in the overall design. Don't "early up" a front.
2. Parking shall be located in the rear or side of the building.
3. Maintain or provide clear glass on ground floor storefront openings.

Little Flower Catholic Church c. 1930
Design Guidelines
Requirements for Demolition

Demolition Policy:
Demolition of a building shall only be considered if Alternatives for rehabilitation are not feasible and the loss of a building will not adversely affect the integrity of the district.

The buildings in the historic district are irreplaceable. The quality of the buildings’ craftsmanship, design and range of materials is unapproachable by today’s conventional, rapid-paced and mass-produced standards. While the designers, builders, and original owners can no longer touch, appreciate, and use the buildings, the historic resources created by them still remain as tangible proof of the culture, heritage, economic, development, and architectural history for the functional and educational benefit of future generations.

Conditions in which demolition may be appropriate

a. if a structure has lost its architectural and historical integrity and importance and removal will not result in a more negative, less appropriate visual effect on the V&E District;

b. if the structure does not contribute to the historical or architectural character and importance of the LPD;

c. if the structure has been inspected and a professional determination has been made that it is unsound, unsafe, and beyond the point where rehabilitation is feasible.
Design Guidelines
Requirements for Demolition

Review Criteria for Demolition

In considering an application for the demolition of a landmark or a resource within the V&E District, the following shall be considered:

a. The architectural, cultural, and/or historical significance of the resource.
b. The contribution of the resource to the architectural character of the district.
c. The contribution of the resource to neighboring property values.
d. The difficulty or impossibility of reproducing such a resource because of its texture, design, material, or detail.

Avoiding demolition is preferable

If applicant proposes a replacement structure on the site of the structure approved for demolition, the MLC may require that final approval of the COA for demolition be contingent upon the applicant receiving a COA for the design of the replacement structure prior to demolition. Once the building has been removed, any improvement to the vacant lot (former building site) should be compatible with the surrounding historic properties.
Orientation and Setbacks

The building setbacks for new construction should fit within the established range of building setbacks traditionally seen within the district.

1. Orient the front of a house to the street and clearly identify the front door.

2. New buildings should be located within the range of yard dimensions seen in the block.

3. Maintain the uniform spacing of side yards.

Diagram illustrates contextual setbacks, which align with adjacent structures. Mis-matched setbacks should be avoided.
Avoid taller or vertically proportioned building such as “tall skinnies.”

**Design Guidelines**

*New Infill Construction*

New construction should take a contemporary architectural approach while respecting the materials, style, and massing of its neighboring houses.

**Scale & Proportion**

1. Maintain the scale, rhythm and proportion that exists along the block.

2. Avoid taller or vertically proportioned building, which are not compatible with the uniform context of historic structures.

3. New construction should be of a similar number of stories as the majority of the structures in the block containing the subject property.
Design Guidelines
New Infill Construction

Height, Scale & Proportion

Avoid taller or vertically proportioned building, which are not compatible and do not maintain the scale, rhythm and proportion that exists along the block.
Design Guidelines
New Infill Construction

Exterior Materials for New Structures

New exterior materials should be compatible with materials used throughout the district consists of masonry, stone, wood trim & lap siding, and stucco.

1. Use only **durable materials** compatible with existing contributing structures.

2. Masonry shall be similar to that seen traditionally in the district. Brick used should have a modular dimension consistent with traditional brick.

3. Stucco is an appropriate exterior cladding material for architectural styles that typically used stucco. *(EIFS, and other synthetic stucco-type materials, are not historically compatible alternatives, and not permissible.)*

4. Avoid introducing exterior materials not readily used throughout the district.

Metal, aluminum siding and vinyl siding are typically not considered historically compatible alternative materials, and should not be used within the district.
V&E Historic Landmarks Designation & Design Guidelines

This Initiative builds a base for an informed community conversation about appropriate design character & regulations within Vollintine-Evergreen historic district.

Landmarks Designation Process:

Step 1: Data Collection & Public Engagement

Step 2: Draft Overlay Zoning & Design Guidelines

Step 3: Zoning & Final Design Guidelines Documents

Step 4: Regulatory Submission & Adoption Process

4a: Memphis Landmark Commission Review & Approval

4b: Land Use Control Board Review & Approval

4c: Memphis City Council Review & Approval
Q&A
Questions & Answers
V&E Design Guidelines & User Guide
Draft #2 is online @
https://veca.org/landmarks-2/

Public Comments Due:
Thursday August 27, 2020
6 pm CT
See the VECA website for more information:

https://veca.org/landmarks-2/

**CONTACT US**
WE WOULD LOVE TO HEAR FROM YOU!

EMAIL ADDRESS
vecahistoric@gmail.com

MAILING ADDRESS
VECA
Attention: Landmarks
1680 Jackson Avenue
Memphis, TN 38107

WEBSITE
www.veca.org